Mission Statement

“To enhance the quality of life of residents and visitors by providing the highest level of safe, clean, affordable, responsive and reliable public transportation through a coordinated and convenient bus and rail system”
Table of Contents

**Introduction** 4

**American Bus Benchmarking Group** 5

**Service Delivery**
- Ridership 8
- Performance 9
- On-Time Performance 10
- Route Performance Analysis 13
- Mileage Efficiency 19

**Fleet**
- Reliability 22
- Performance 23
- Vehicle Profile 24
- Vehicle Maintenance 26

**ParaTransit**
- Ridership 30
- Registrations 31
- Eligibility Types 32
- Trip Types 33
- Trip Delivery 34

**Customer Care**
- Call Center Activities 36
- Customer Commendations & Complaints 38
- Customer Complaints by Category 39
- Complaint Time Analysis 40
- Complaints per 100,000 Riders 41

**Financial**
- Revenue 44
- Expenses 47
- Metro Pass Sales 48
- Fuel Costs 49
- Attendance 50

**Safety / Environment**
- Collisions 52
- Workplace 54
- Carbon Footprint 55
- Utility Analysis 56

**Our Future** 58
INTRODUCTION

NFTA-Metro is the Public Transit provider serving Erie and Niagara counties in New York. Metro operates 62 bus routes with over 4,500 bus stops being serviced, along with a 6.2 mile light rail system servicing 14 stations. Metro employs 648 bus and rail operators who have a combined driving experience of over 5,700 years, supported by a comprehensive staff of mechanics, technicians and specialists responsible for maintaining the system.

As a public agency, NFTA Metro is accountable to the people we serve. We want to make it easy for our customers and stakeholders to understand and review our performance. Measuring the performance of a transit system is the first step toward efficient and proactive management. The use of performance measures for transportation planning and operations is critical for transportation agencies who are managing evolving demands with diminishing resources. The information in this report is used by Metro to identify both trends in our operations and the impacts of external influences which provides the management team with metrics to communicate organizational effectiveness.

Measuring, monitoring and reporting performance on a regular basis helps Metro achieve the following objectives:

- Continually improve the organization by monitoring progress.
- Maintain accountability for return on investment and effectiveness of accomplishing our mission.
- Maintain a comprehensive capital and operations planning process to maintain and secure additional funding.
- Improve operations through the monitoring of metrics developed to assess performance.
- Improve management by quantifying the performance of Metro products, services, and the processes. Effective performance measures are tools that help us:
  - Monitor performance to judge how well we are doing,
  - Know if we are meeting our goals and if our customers are satisfied,
  - Take action to affect performance or improve efficiency as necessary.

Performance measures provide data and information necessary to make informed decisions. Performance measures also provide trends to determine whether actual performance is getting better, staying the same, or getting worse over time. The best performance measures start conversations about organizational priorities, the allocation of resources, ways to improve performance, and offer an honest assessment of effectiveness.

This annual performance report provides a summary of the performance metrics that Metro monitors to keep the system efficient, economical, safe, and reliable while pursuing continued improvement. Most of the representations compare data for either four or five fiscal years (April 1 through March 31 of the following year). Some of the measures compare fixed route bus service, Paratransit Access Line (PAL) and rail operations. There is performance data on service delivery, PAL, revenue vehicle fleet, customer care, financial, safety and environmental.

It is Metro’s intent to use these metrics to provide a look back at where we have been as well as provide a roadmap to the future. This report is updated annually and may introduce new performance measures to expand our ability to evaluate our efforts and keep our review relevant.
NFTA METRO is a member of the American Bus Benchmarking Group (ABBG). Participation in the Group provides Metro with benchmarking capabilities within our bus operations to evaluate our performance and identify opportunities for improvement. The ABBG was established in 2011 and is administered by Imperial College, London, England. It is comprised of 20 public transit agencies providing bus service throughout the United States.

The benefits of membership in ABBG includes developing concise, well-balanced and comparable performance measures, identifying underlying trends, sharing best practices, and publishing annual reports. A confidentiality framework is key to successful benchmarking insuring that members can be open and honest which maximizes the benefits of collaboration.

Benchmarking is not merely a comparison of data or a creation of rankings. The structured Key Performance Indicators (KPI) comparisons can be used for:

- Stimulating productive “why” questions
- Identifying lines of further inquiry (e.g. via website forum or clearinghouse studies)
- Identifying strengths and weaknesses
- Monitoring trends by analyzing performance over time, to identify improvement or erosion of performance
- Internal motivation – identifying and setting achievable targets for improved performance
- Supporting dialogue with government, authorities, media and other stakeholders (confidentiality permitting)

**American Bus Benchmarking Group Phase 5 Participants:**

20 Members Across the US in Urban & Suburban Areas
Throughout this report you will find ABBG results outlined in gray. The NFTA data is highlighted in yellow and shows our ranking among the other members of ABBG. There are accompanying NFTA charts that show our own data with the 2015 data highlighted in yellow to draw the comparison between both charts.
SERVICE DELIVERY

Ridership

Reported Metro ridership is based on data collected through a Federal Transit Administration (FTA) approved sampling program and on-vehicle technology. Ridership includes all trips delivered on Metro Bus, Metro Rail and Paratransit Access Line (PAL).
SERVICE DELIVERY

Performance

Passengers per Vehicle Mile is a measurement of service efficiency. Metro pursues improved operating efficiency by attracting additional riders and maximizing route design.
SERVICE DELIVERY

On-Time Performance

Metro monitors the efficiency of the service it provides. Metro Bus “On-Time Performance” is the calculated difference between the actual time a Metro vehicle encounters a specific stop compared to the time that vehicle was scheduled to be there.

![On-Time Performance Chart]

*On-Time for the Metro Rail does not include the period when service was disrupted by construction projects requiring single tracking.

On-Time Calculation

Metro Bus

The window for Metro Bus On-Time is six minutes. An arrival is considered on time if it is less than two minutes early and less than four minutes late. Late arrivals can be affected by weather conditions, street conditions, boarding/alighting patterns or traffic along the route.

Metro Rail

The window for Metro Rail On-Time is one minute.

PAL

The window for PAL On-Time is 30 minutes. When a PAL eligible rider makes a reservation, a pickup time is established. The PAL window is 15 minutes before that pickup time to 15 minutes after the pickup time.
SERVICE DELIVERY

On Time Performance – FIXED ROUTE

**Daily On-Time**

- **Sunday**: 85.1%
- **Weekday**: 84.1%
- **Saturday**: 82.2%

**Hourly On-Time**

- 4:00 AM to 11:00 PM
- 0% to 100%

**Monthly On-Time**

- April 2015 to March 2016
- 0% to 100%
SERVICE DELIVERY

On Time Performance – FIXED ROUTE

Early arrivals are the portion of non-compliant arrivals that can be improved through management and technology enhancements and are less related to external factors.
SERVICE DELIVERY

Route Performance Analysis – Weekday Service ONLY

Metro Service Delivery and Evaluation Guidelines have been established to provide an objective basis for assessing the performance of existing Metro Bus service. Routes are grouped by type or characteristics of service and evaluated to provide the basis for developing service adjustments.

Passengers per Revenue Hour
This represents the productivity of the route by the number of passengers carried for each hour of revenue service provided. It is computed by dividing the number of average weekday riders by the associated number of revenue hours of service for each route.

![Diagram showing passengers per revenue hour for primary/core routes with GOAL 37 for FYE 2016 and FYE 2015]
SERVICE DELIVERY

Route Performance Analysis – Weekday Service ONLY

Secondary Routes
Passengers per Revenue Hour
GOAL 24

FYE 2016  FYE 2015
SERVICE DELIVERY

Route Performance Analysis – Weekday Service ONLY

**Collector Express Routes**

Passengers per Revenue Hour

GOAL 19

- GRAND ISLAND
- N. TONAWANDA
- WILLIAMSVILLE
- CLEVELAND HILL
- GEO URBAN
- ALDEN
- EAST AURORA
- ORCHARD PARK
- HAMBURG
- WEST SENECA
- LOTUS BAY
- TONAWANDA

**Limited Express Routes**

Passengers per Revenue Hour

GOAL 18

- NIAGARA FALLS
- LOCKPORT
- AIRPORT
SERVICe DELIVERY

Route Performance Analysis – Weekday Service ONLY

Farebox Recovery

This represents the percent of operating expenses which are directly covered by the passenger fares. It is computed by dividing the total passenger fare revenue by the total operating expenses for each route.

![Farebox Recovery Chart]

Primary/Core Routes
Farebox Recovery
GOAL 40%

- 3 GRANT
- 4 BROADWAY
- 5 NIAGARA KENMORE
- 6 SYCAMORE
- 12 UTICA
- 13 KENSINGTON
- 19 BAILEY
- 20 ELMWOOD
- 23 FILLMORE HERTEL
- 24 GENESEE
- 25 DELAWARE
- 26 DELEVAN
- 32 AMHERST
- 55 PINE AVE

FYE 2016 vs FYE 2015
SERVICE DELIVERY

Route Performance Analysis – Weekday Service ONLY

Secondary Routes
Farebox Recovery
GOAL 25%

- 1 WILLIAM
- 2 CLINTON
- 7 BAYNES-RICHMOND
- 8 MAIN
- 11 COLVIN
- 14 ABBOTT
- 15 SENECA
- 16 SOUTH PARK
- 18 JEFFERSON
- 22 PORTER-BEST
- 29 WOHLERS
- 34 N.F. BLVD.
- 35 SHERIDAN
- 36 HAMBURG
- 42 LACKAWANNA
- 44 LOCKPORT
- 46 LANCASTER
- 47 YOUNGS RD.
- 48 WILLIAMSVILLE
- 49 MILLARD-SUBURBAN
- 50 MAIN-NIAGARA
- 52 HYDE PARK
- 54 MILITARY
- 57 TONAWANDAS

FYE 2016
FYE 2015
SERVICE DELIVERY

Route Performance Analysis – Weekday Service ONLY

Collector Express Routes
Farebox Recovery
GOAL 20%

Limited Express Routes
Farebox Recovery
GOAL 19%
SERVICE DELIVERY

Mileage Efficiency

Mileage efficiency compares the amount of vehicle miles traveled providing revenue generating service (REV miles) with the miles traveled when the vehicle is out of service (Deadhead miles). This measure reflects route design efficiency.

Note:

Metro Rail mileage efficiency is maintained in excess of 98%.
FLEET

Reliability

Metro’s bus fleet consists of primarily 40’ buses with either diesel or hybrid (diesel/electric) power. The PAL fleet is comprised of vans powered by either diesel or gasoline. Vehicle performance has a direct impact on Metro’s ability to deliver reliable, safe service. Measurement of fleet reliability and efficiency demonstrates the effectiveness of Metro’s maintenance program.

Occasionally mechanical defects necessitate removing a vehicle from service. Miles without Service Interruptions reflects how many miles a bus has traveled in service before an unscheduled breakdown takes it off the road resulting in riders being transferred to a backup bus to continue their trip.
Fuel economy and Motor Oil economy are directly related to the state of good repair and technological innovation of the bus fleet and are impacted by both maintenance and fleet age.
FLEET

Vehicle Profile

An underlying factor to the vehicle reliability is the overall age and mileage of the vehicle. The FTA, which provides the major portion of funding for vehicle purchase, has prescribed the useful life of a 40’ vehicle as 12 years of revenue service and/or 500,000 miles.

**Average Age per Bus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average Miles per Bus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>332,110</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>350,946</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FLEET

Vehicle Profile

Based on the prescribed useful life/miles milestones, a portion of the bus fleet is in need of replacement. The Federal Transit Administration identifies the useful life of a bus at 12 years and the useful mileage at 500,000 miles.
Buses out of service are undergoing repair of defects and are not available for revenue service. Buses out of service include mechanical defects, vehicle corrosion and collision related maintenance and repair requirements.
FLEET

Vehicle Maintenance

A comprehensive training program is mandatory to improve vehicle reliability and maintain performance of an aging fleet. Fleet defects are tracked to identify specific problem needs for both training and systemic areas of concern for bus maintenance. Fleet defects are directly related to preventative maintenance and vehicle age and mileage.
Vehicle maintenance training is provided to address specific elements of the Fleet to pursue improvements in Fleet performance and reliability.
PARATRANSIT
PARATRANSIT

Ridership

Metro has a fully accessible bus and rail system. For those passengers who cannot access our regular Metro Bus and Rail due to a disability (temporary or permanent) we provide safe, reliable curb-to-curb transportation services through the Paratransit Access Line (PAL).

![Ridership Chart]

![Average Daily Trips Chart]
Paratransit ridership is comprised of passengers who have obtained eligibility by completing the application process (eligible riders). Eligibility to use PAL is determined based on the guidelines contained in the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990.
PARATRANSIT

Eligibility Types

Access to PAL service is established through the application process when conditions may be applied to eligibility:

- Unconditional eligibility entitles an ADA rider to unlimited PAL service
- Conditional eligibility places restrictions on use of PAL service based on disability*

*For example, the ADA rider may only be eligible to use PAL service during winter months or for travel to unfamiliar destinations where they have not been travel trained.
PARATRANSIT

Trip Types

Trip bookings are classified as either casual or subscription trips. Casual, single trips are non-recurring trips made by an eligible rider. Subscription trips are trips requested between the same origin and destination on fixed days at fixed times.

Eligible riders, who require assistance, may request to travel with a Personal Care Attendant (PCA) who rides free of charge (non-rev). Eligible riders are also permitted to travel with a companion who rides for the same fare as the eligible rider (rev).

Typical PAL Ridership
5 Year Average

Clients - REV 93%
Companions - REV 2%
PCA - NON REV 5%
PARATRANSIT

Trip Delivery

Trip delivery is based on trips scheduled for ADA eligible riders.

Undelivered Trips include:

No Show (1.3%)
The Metro vehicle arrived within 30 minute pickup window and waited at least five minutes but the rider did not board.

Late Cancel (0.9%)
Rider called to cancel a trip less than two hours prior to the scheduled pickup window.

Missed Trip (0.1%)
The Metro vehicle arrived outside the pickup window and the rider found other means of transportation or did not travel.
The Customer Care Department is the first point of contact for our customers seeking information on services. They handle all inquiries for information on all Metro Bus and Rail routes, schedules, trip planning, service disruptions and delivery issues for both bus and rail.

In assisting customers, critical information obtained from both internal and external sources is utilized along with state of the art customer service systems.
CUSTOMER CARE

Call Center Activities

Customer input is a critical element of providing quality public transit service. In order to provide opportunities for our customers to engage Metro, our Customer Care response line (855-7211) is utilized.

![Call Center Volume Graph]

FYE 2016 reflects the introduction of a new Interactive Voice Response (IVR) System for which data does not reflect multiple, repeating calls from like numbers and migration to other modes of information.

Customer calls are initially answered by the IVR system with an automated message directing the caller to select an option which usually takes about 15 seconds (introduction time). This allows the caller to get standard information quickly (IVR Answered). If the need arises for more specific information, the caller can then transfer to a Customer Care Agent (Agent Answered) for assistance.

![Customer Call Composition Graph]

Once the caller requests Agent contact, the average wait time reflects the time until the Agent engages the caller. Once an Agent is engaged, the actual conversation is measured as talk time.
CUSTOMER CARE

Call Center Activity

Our new On-Line InfoWeb, introduced in 2015, greatly improved our customers’ ability to access transit information.

Through the introduction of the InfoWeb System, the distribution of incoming calls has occurred allowing the migration of calls to the new technology. This migration allows callers to gain access to more information in a timely fashion enhancing the customer experience.

The InfoWeb provides instant schedule updates, real time bus arrivals, bus stop identification numbers, next bus times, closest bus stop, reroutes, bulletins and much more. Customers now have access, 24/7, to this information in two languages using their cell phones. Customers can now either text or email their requests.
CUSTOMER CARE

Customer Commendations & Complaints

Customers are encouraged to comment on their experience using Metro. These comments are documented as either Commendations or Complaints.

**Commendations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>182</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Complaints**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>968</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>968</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>968</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CUSTOMER CARE

Customer Complaints

Customer complaints are delineated by the specific issues of Professionalism, Service Delivery or Equipment encountered and then reported by category for further evaluation and resolution.
CUSTOMER CARE

Complaint Time Analysis

Complaints are monitored for when they occur.

![Complaints Monthly Graph]

![Complaints Daily Average Graph]

Metro has nine Agents for three shifts on Monday – Friday from 6:00 am to 6:00 pm. On nights and weekends, the telephone lines are answered by the IVR system.

![Complaints Hourly Average Graph]
CUSTOMER CARE

Complaints by Route

Complaints / 100,000 Riders
by Route

FYE 2016 FYE 2015

AIRPORT EX - 204
TONAWANDA - 79
LOTUS BAY - 76
WEST SENECA-75
HAMBURG-74
ORCHARD PARK-72
EAST AURORA - 70
ALDEN-69
GEO URBAN-68
CLEVELAND HILL - 67
WILLIAMSVILLE - 66
LOCKPORT - 64
DELAWARE-61
NIAGARA FALLS-60
TONAWANDAS-57
PINE AVE-55
MILITARY-54
HYDE PARK-52
MAIN/NIAGARA-50
MILLARD SUBURBAN - 49
WILLIAMSVILLE - 48
YOUNGS ROAD - 47
LANCASTER - 46
LOCKPORT - 44
LACKAWANNA-42
GRAND ISLAND - 40
HAMBURG - 36
SHERIDAN - 35
NIAG. FALLS BLVD - 34
AMHERST - 32
WOHLERS - 29
DELAVAN - 26
DELAWARE - 25
GENESEE - 24
FILLMORE/HERTEL - 23
PORTER/BEST - 22
ELMWOOD - 20
BAILEY - 19
JEFFERSON - 18
SOUTH PARK - 16
SENeca - 15
ABBOTT - 14
KENSINGTON - 13
UTICA - 12
COLVIN - 11
MAIN - 8
BAYNES-RICHMOND - 7
SYCAMORE - 6
NIAGARA-KENMORE - 5
BROADWAY - 4
GRANT - 3
CLINTON - 2
WILLIAM - 1

0 10 20 30 40 50 60 70 80

FYE 2016 FYE 2015
CUSTOMER CARE

Complaints by Riders

![Complaints per 100,000 Riders](chart.png)
Revenue

Revenue primarily consists of passenger fares and operating assistance from local, State and Federal sources. Other revenue consists of advertising fees and miscellaneous revenues. Passengers’ fares make up approximately 35% of total revenues.
FINANCIAL

Revenue

Revenue Sources

Subsidy Assistance - 2015 ABBG data
FINANCIAL

Revenue

**Average Fare per Passenger**

- **Metro Bus**
  - FYE 2012: $1.10
  - FYE 2013: $1.00
  - FYE 2014: $1.10
  - FYE 2015: $1.20
  - FYE 2016: $1.30

- **Metro Rail**
  - FYE 2012: $0.80
  - FYE 2013: $0.90
  - FYE 2014: $1.00
  - FYE 2015: $1.10
  - FYE 2016: $1.20

- **PAL Vans**
  - FYE 2012: $1.50
  - FYE 2013: $1.60
  - FYE 2014: $1.70
  - FYE 2015: $1.80
  - FYE 2016: $1.90

**Passengers per Revenue Vehicle Hour**

- **Metro Bus**
  - FYE 2012: 30
  - FYE 2013: 35
  - FYE 2014: 40
  - FYE 2015: 45
  - FYE 2016: 50

- **Metro Rail**
  - FYE 2012: 80
  - FYE 2013: 75
  - FYE 2014: 70
  - FYE 2015: 65
  - FYE 2016: 60

**Note:** The diagrams illustrate the fare and passenger data for each division over the years 2012 to 2016.
FINANCIAL

Expenses

Expenses include personal services, maintenance & repairs, transit fuel & power, utilities, insurance and injuries, safety & security, general business & support services. Personal Services account for approximately 70% of all operational expenses.
FINANCIAL

Metro Pass Sales

Metro Passes are distributed through a variety of sources providing alternatives for customer access to pass media. These sources include:
- On Bus
- MTC (Downtown Bus Terminal)
- TVM (Ticket Vending Machines)
  - Rail Stations
  - Bus Transit Centers
- Agencies\Retail Outlets\Metro web page

![Metro Passes Point of Sale](image)

**1 Day Pass**

![1 Day Pass](image)

**Multi Day Passes** (introduced 2012)

![Multi Day Passes](image)

**Monthly Passes**

![Monthly Passes](image)

**PAL Passes**

![PAL Passes](image)
FINANCIAL

Fuel Cost

In order to maintain budget stability and minimize costs, Metro may lock in fuel purchases for a portion of consumption. Metro fuel costs are based on the total volume purchased at both the market rate and fixed rate for the associated quantities. Market cost for fuel is based on the total cost that would be expended if we were to purchase our entire consumption at the market rate.

*Includes cost of all fuel purchased including open market and fixed price.
Improved attendance reliability lessens the Personal Services Costs associated with absenteeism. Unscheduled absences can occur for illness, personal or emergency situation for which staffing adjustments are required and may necessitate overtime expenditures.
SAFETY/ENVIRONMENT

Collisions

Metro operators drive over 10,000,000 miles every year in the service area. Operating the fleet, subject to various weather and road conditions, will inevitably result in some vehicle collisions. Safe driver training techniques and mechanical soundness of the vehicles allow Metro to maintain a very low collision rate.

Preventable Collisions

Preventable Collisions - 2015 ABBG data
SAFETY/ENVIRONMENT

Collisions

Collision Rate per 100,000 miles

Collision Rate per 100,000 miles


SAFETY/ENVIRONMENT

Workplace

Personal injuries have a direct impact on Metro’s ability to provide reliable, cost effective service. Regular monitoring, reporting and evaluating injuries are critical to maintaining operations and protecting our employees.

Each month, the most predominant personal injuries are reviewed by the Executive Director and top levels of Metro management. Through their analysis, the injury root causes are discussed and recommendations are developed to keep employee safety a high priority within Metro.
SAFETY/ENVIRONMENT

Carbon Footprint

Many considerations go into being a good community neighbor. The effect on the atmosphere due to emissions, the disposal of our waste products, the recycling of our motor oils and solid wastes and the energy consumed by our facilities' operations are all areas that Metro monitors to find effectiveness and efficiency in the operations.

The following charts represent Metro's efforts in reduction of the Carbon Footprint of our Fleet.
Utility Analysis

Utility Costs
past 5 years

Electric 66%
Natural Gas 29%
Water 5%

Utility Costs by Type

FYE 2012
FYE 2013
FYE 2014
FYE 2015
FYE 2016
SAFETY/ENVIRONMENT

Utility Analysis

Annual Electricity Usage KWH

Annual Natural Gas Usage CCF
What does the future hold for Metro and its riders?

- New buses powered by alternative fuel sources
- Continued transparency and accountability through the Metro Performance Report
- New Fare collection system with more flexibility and greater access for rider convenience
- Connecting Metro with its customers using social media
- Rebuilding and modernizing the entire rail car fleet
- Technology enhancements for improved customer communications
- Next generation Metro bus corridors (Niagara Street)
- Analysis of transit alternatives to support community development
- Develop partnerships and marketing strategies to improve revenue and service

Come ride with us!